

### Attachment 3 - 2016 MSW HAULING RFP EVALUATION

Evaluation Criteria	Custom Ecology, Inc. (CEI)	Hilco Transport, Inc.	Notes
<b>Responsiveness:</b> Proposal thoroughness in addressing designated services, staff responsibilities, local resources, litigation history, and environmental compliance.	x	X	Hilco was most responsive; CEI was responsive
<b>Qualifications:</b> Relevant company qualifications and experience similar to that proposed.	X	X	Both companies meet minimum qualifications; Hilco has been City's hauler since 2006 and provided exceptional service.
<b>Financial Strength:</b> Adequacy of Contractor's financial status and stability, and proposed financing	x	X	Reviewed by Finance consultant; Hilco financially stronger based on key business ratios
<b>Environmental:</b> History of environmental violations	X	X	No history of environmental violations; CEI experienced littering issue in Wake County; resolved with new tarp system
<b>Safety:</b> Contractor's safety record	x	X	Hilco's safety records are exceptional; CEI not as safe, but acceptable
<b>M/WBE:</b> Offered participation	X	X	Both companies met good faith efforts
<b>Operations:</b> Contractor's equipment and also any traffic violations	x	X	Hilco vehicle out of service rate well below national average; CEI's above, but will purchase new equipment
<b>Project Approach:</b> Thoroughness of the approach, including the level to which it aligns with City's goals and objectives. Clarity with which Contractor articulates issues of concern and transition from current operations	x	X	Hilco's project approach more detailed; slight edge to Hilco
<b>Project Schedule:</b> Adequacy of project schedule to understand the detailed steps and timeline of the project including the reasonableness of time to implement project	x	X	Both adequate: Hilco has incumbent advantage
<b>Cost Proposal:</b> Contractor's submitted rates.	X	x	CEI offers significant cost savings for Uwharrie and Randolph, \$200,000 to \$240,000/year based on current tons: Hilco low price on all other options (4)
<b>Draft Agreement:</b> Adherence to draft agreement	X	X	No exceptions by either company