

Attachment 4 – Hauling & Disposal Combined Cost Analysis

July 27, 2016
 Note to Reader:

The following five tables present pricing information from the City of Greensboro’s recent RFP #2016-10419 for Municipal Solid Waste Hauling Services and GePS Event #8214 for Municipal Solid Waste Disposal Services. Hauling proposals were initially received May 6, 2016 from Atomic Transport, LLC, Stafford Transport of North Carolina doing business as Custom Ecology, Inc. (CEI) and Hilco Transport, Inc. Following initial review, the City shortlisted the hauling proposers to CEI and Hilco and revised per-mile pricing was requested based on City-provided routes to area landfills. CEI and Hilco provided the revised pricing on June 8, 2016. Disposal proposals were received July 12, 2016 from Republic Services of North Carolina, LLC, Waste Connections of North Carolina, Inc., and Waste Management of the Carolinas, Inc. Following is a summary of the content of the tables:

- Table 1 – Round trip mileage to area landfills based on City-approved routes
- Table 2 – Hauling prices from revised Price Form 1 of the Hauling proposals as received June 8, 2016
- Table 3 – Estimated per-ton hauling costs to each landfill based on assumed 23.5 tons per load
- Table 4 – Disposal fee from Price Form 1 of the Disposal proposals received July 12, 2016
- Table 5 – Estimated per-ton total (hauling and disposal costs combined) to each landfill based on assumed 23.5 tons per load

The hauling and disposal proposals remain under review at this time.

| Table 1 - City Approved Round Trip Truck Miles per Landfill Option | | |
|---|----------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| | Truck Miles (Round-Trip) | |
| | HILCO TRANSPORT, INC. | CUSTOM ECOLOGY, INC. |
| Uwharrie Environmental Landfill | 138.2 | 138.2 |
| Anson County Landfill | 220.0 | 220.0 |
| Sampson County Landfill | 256.0 | 256.0 |
| Charlotte Motor Speedway Landfill | 166.4 | 166.4 |
| Randolph County Landfill | 80.4 | 80.4 |
| Upper Piedmont Regional Landfill | 160.0 | 160.0 |
| Note: The data presented in this table was taken from Price Form 1 of each hauling proposal and does not address any clarifications, exceptions, or alternates, if any, offered by the proposer. Information reflects the revised city approved routes and Hilco's and CEI's revised pricing information submitted on 06/08/2016. | | |

Attachment 4 – Hauling & Disposal Combined Cost Analysis

| Table 2 - Service Fee from Price Form 1 (Revised 06/08/2016) | | |
|---|----------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| | \$/Mile (Round-Trip Mile) | |
| | HILCO TRANSPORT, INC. | CUSTOM ECOLOGY, INC. |
| 50 - 100 Miles | | |
| Annual Tonnage | 130 cu. yd. trailer | 125 cu. yd. trailer |
| 60,000 - 100,000 | 2.679 | 2.148 |
| 100,001 - 150,000 | 2.586 | 2.148 |
| 150,001 - 200,000 | 2.544 | 2.148 |
| 200,001 - 250,000 | 2.504 | 2.148 |
| 101 - 150 Miles | | |
| Annual Tonnage | 130 cu. yd. trailer | 125 cu. yd. trailer |
| 60,000 - 100,000 | 1.888 | 1.628 |
| 100,001 - 150,000 | 1.828 | 1.628 |
| 150,001 - 200,000 | 1.813 | 1.628 |
| 200,001 - 250,000 | 1.769 | 1.628 |
| 151 - 200 Miles | | |
| Annual Tonnage | 130 cu. yd. trailer | 125 cu. yd. trailer |
| 60,000 - 100,000 | 1.839 | 1.990 |
| 100,001 - 150,000 | 1.820 | 1.990 |
| 150,001 - 200,000 | 1.791 | 1.990 |
| 200,001 - 250,000 | 1.754 | 1.990 |
| Over 200 Miles | | |
| Annual Tonnage | 130 cu. yd. trailer | 125 cu. yd. trailer |
| 60,000 - 100,000 | 1.833 | 1.980 |
| 100,001 - 150,000 | 1.796 | 1.980 |
| 150,001 - 200,000 | 1.758 | 1.980 |
| 200,001 - 250,000 | 1.744 | 1.980 |
| <p>Note: The data presented in this table was taken from Price Form 1 of each hauling proposal and does not address any clarifications, exceptions, or alternates, if any, offered by the proposer. Information reflects the revised city approved routes and Hilco's and CEI's revised pricing information submitted on 06/08/2016.</p> | | |

Attachment 4 – Hauling & Disposal Combined Cost Analysis

| Table 3 - Price per Ton Hauling Estimates (Revised 06/08/2016) | | | | | |
|--|-----------------------|---------------------|--|-----------------------|---------------------|
| Randolph County Landfill | | | Charlotte Motor Speedway Landfill | | |
| Annual Tonnage | Hilco (\$/Ton) | CEI (\$/Ton) | Annual Tonnage | Hilco (\$/Ton) | CEI (\$/Ton) |
| 60,000 - 100,000 | 9.166 | 7.349 | 60,000 - 100,000 | 13.022 | 14.091 |
| 100,001 - 150,000 | 8.847 | 7.349 | 100,001 - 150,000 | 12.887 | 14.091 |
| 150,001 - 200,000 | 8.704 | 7.349 | 150,001 - 200,000 | 12.682 | 14.091 |
| 200,001 - 250,000 | 8.567 | 7.349 | 200,001 - 250,000 | 12.420 | 14.091 |
| Uwharrie Environmental Landfill | | | Anson County Landfill | | |
| Annual Tonnage | Hilco (\$/Ton) | CEI (\$/Ton) | Annual Tonnage | Hilco (\$/Ton) | CEI (\$/Ton) |
| 60,000 - 100,000 | 11.103 | 9.574 | 60,000 - 100,000 | 17.160 | 18.536 |
| 100,001 - 150,000 | 10.750 | 9.574 | 100,001 - 150,000 | 16.814 | 18.536 |
| 150,001 - 200,000 | 10.662 | 9.574 | 150,001 - 200,000 | 16.458 | 18.536 |
| 200,001 - 250,000 | 10.403 | 9.574 | 200,001 - 250,000 | 16.327 | 18.536 |
| Upper Piedmont Regional Landfill | | | Sampson County Landfill | | |
| Annual Tonnage | Hilco (\$/Ton) | CEI (\$/Ton) | Annual Tonnage | Hilco (\$/Ton) | CEI (\$/Ton) |
| 60,000 - 100,000 | 12.521 | 13.549 | 60,000 - 100,000 | 19.968 | 21.569 |
| 100,001 - 150,000 | 12.391 | 13.549 | 100,001 - 150,000 | 19.565 | 21.569 |
| 150,001 - 200,000 | 12.194 | 13.549 | 150,001 - 200,000 | 19.151 | 21.569 |
| 200,001 - 250,000 | 11.942 | 13.549 | 200,001 - 250,000 | 18.998 | 21.569 |
| <p>Note: The data presented in this table was taken from Price Form 1 of each hauling proposal and does not address any clarifications, exceptions, or alternates, if any, offered by the proposer.</p> <p>Information reflects the revised city approved routes and Hilco's and CEI's revised pricing information submitted on 06/08/2016.</p> <p>The per ton price is found by dividing the product of the round trip truck miles and the \$/mile rate by the assumed value of 23.5 tons per load.</p> | | | | | |

| Table 4 - Disposal Fee from Price Form 1 | | | |
|---|------------------|----------------|------------------|
| Annual Tonnage | \$/ton (2016) | | |
| | Waste Management | Republic Waste | Waste Connection |
| 60,000 - 100,000 | 19.50 | 21.00 | 24.50 |
| 100,001 - 150,000 | 17.88 | 21.00 | 24.50 |
| 150,001 - 200,000 | 17.88 | 21.00 | 19.00 |
| 200,001 - 250,000 | 17.88 | 21.00 | 15.00 |
| <p>Note: The data presented in this table was taken from Price Form 1 of each disposal proposal received July 12, 2016 and does not address any clarifications, exceptions, or alternates, if any, offered by the proposer.</p> | | | |

Attachment 4 – Hauling & Disposal Combined Cost Analysis

| Table 5 - Price per Ton Total Estimates | | | | | |
|--|---------------------------|-------------------------|---|---------------------------|-------------------------|
| Randolph County Landfill (Waste Management) | | | Charlotte Motor Speedway Landfill | | |
| Annual Tonnage | Hilco (\$/Ton) | CEI (\$/Ton) | Annual Tonnage | Hilco (\$/Ton) | CEI (\$/Ton) |
| 60,000 - 100,000 | 28.666 | 26.849 | Not submitted for disposal | | |
| 100,001 - 150,000 | 26.727 | 25.229 | | | |
| 150,001 - 200,000 | 26.584 | 25.229 | | | |
| 200,001 - 250,000 | 26.447 | 25.229 | | | |
| Uwharrie Environmental Landfill (Republic Waste) | | | Anson County Landfill (Waste Connection) | | |
| Annual Tonnage | Hilco (\$/Ton) | CEI (\$/Ton) | Annual Tonnage | Hilco (\$/Ton) | CEI (\$/Ton) |
| 60,000 - 100,000 | 32.103 | 30.574 | 60,000 - 100,000 | 41.660 | 43.036 |
| 100,001 - 150,000 | 31.750 | 30.574 | 100,001 - 150,000 | 41.314 | 43.036 |
| 150,001 - 200,000 | 31.662 | 30.574 | 150,001 - 200,000 | 35.458 | 37.536 |
| 200,001 - 250,000 | 31.403 | 30.574 | 200,001 - 250,000 | 31.327 | 33.536 |
| Upper Piedmont Regional Landfill | | | Sampson County Landfill | | |
| Annual Tonnage | Hilco (\$/Ton) | CEI (\$/Ton) | Annual Tonnage | Hilco (\$/Ton) | CEI (\$/Ton) |
| Not submitted for disposal | | | Not submitted for disposal | | |
| <p>Note: The data presented in this table represents the sum of hauling and disposal prices taken from Price Form 1 of each proposal and does not address any clarifications, exceptions, or alternates, if any, offered by the proposer.</p> <p>Information reflects the revised city approved routes and Hilco's and CEI's revised pricing information submitted on 06/08/2016 combined with the disposal pricing received on July 12, 2016.</p> | | | | | |