

Date: December 1, 2015

To: Mayor and City Council
City Manager

From: Coliseum Director Matt Brown



Re: Coliseum Fieldhouse CMAR Final Rankings and Recommendation

On Wednesday November 4, the City of Greensboro formally issued a Request for Qualifications (RFQ) for the Coliseum Fieldhouse CMAR selection process.

On Thursday November 19, electronic copies of the four (4) CMAR firms credentials were hand delivered to members of the Coliseum Fieldhouse CMAR Evaluation & Ranking Committee which included: Project Architect, Ken Mayer of Moser, Mayer Phoenix & Associates; Coliseum Complex Managing Director Matt Brown; City of Greensboro MWBE HUB Coordinator, Gwen Carter; City Building and Inspections Department Head, Kenny Mc Dowell PE; Juhann Waller PE, Waller & Associates; Coliseum Complex Building Superintendent Mike Perdue, a NC Class A Licensed Electrician; and, James Dickens, Esq., Assistant City Attorney.

On Friday November 20, the CMAR Evaluation & Ranking Committee met to review and determine the three (3) CMAR finalists to be invited to make Oral Presentations using a 100 point scale rating system and blind balloting based on the five (5) criteria measures defined in the RFQ.

On Monday November 30, Oral Presentations were made to the CMAR Evaluation & Ranking Committee. The CMAR Evaluation & Ranking Committee, again using the 100 point scale rating system conducted blind balloting based on the same five (5) criteria measures as defined in the RFQ and used earlier to determine the three (3) finalists, to determine the final order of rankings of the three (3) CMAR finalists. The final rankings were:

- | | |
|-------------------------------|-------|
| 1. Samet/SRS | 92.43 |
| 2. Frank L. Blum/J.S. Mention | 89.00 |
| 3. Rentenbach/SCS | 88.57 |

Copies of the actual tabulations results for each of the three (3) finalists based on the five (5) criteria measures are attached for your review.

The City of Greensboro MWBE HUB Coordinator, Gwen Carter who served as a member of the CMAR Evaluation & Ranking Committee has reviewed the three (3) CMAR firm's MWBE Good Faith Efforts documents and has determined that each CMAR firm has met the City MWBE Good Faith Efforts outlined in the RFQ.

Therefore, on behalf of the Coliseum Fieldhouse CMAR Evaluation & Ranking Committee, we respectfully recommend that the City Council, approve the final order of the rankings of the three (3) CMAR firms as follows: 1. Samet/SRS; 2. Frank L. Blum/J.S. Mention; 3. Rentenbach/SCS

And further, as a result of the CMAR final rankings, the CMAR Evaluation & Ranking Committee respectfully recommends that the City Council approve the selection of and authorize that a contract be entered into with Samet/SRS for the Coliseum Fieldhouse Pre-Construction services pending the satisfactory completion of contract negotiations between the City's representative and Samet/SRS.

Greensboro Coliseum Fieldhouse

Total All Criteria

Ranking 100 Point Scale

Construction Manager	Frank L Blum / J.S. Mention Corporation	Samet Corporation / SRS, Inc.	Rentenbach / SCS
Calculated Rank----->	2	1	3
Criteria	Value	Point Value	Point Value
1	30	28.29	27.43
2	30	26.14	27.00
3	10	8.86	9.57
4	20	16.86	19.14
5	10	8.86	9.29
100 Point Scale	89.00	92.43	88.57

Greensboro Coliseum Fieldhouse

Construction Manager at Risk (CMAR) Evaluation & Ranking Committee Tabulation

Criteria 1

30 Pts.	Public Assembly or Athletic Facility Construction Experience in excess of 2,500 seating capacity
---------	---

	Frank L Blum / J.S. Mention Corporation	Samet Corporation / SRS, Inc.	Rentenbach / SCS
Calculated Rank >	1	2	3
ERC Member	Rank	Rank	Rank
1	1	2	3
2	1	2	3
3	3	1	2
4	1	3	2
5	2	1	3
6	1	3	2
7	2	1	3
Total Points	198	192	177
30 Point Scale	28.29	27.43	25.29

Ranking 1=30 Points, 2=27 Points, 3=24 Points

Greensboro Coliseum Fieldhouse

Construction Manager at Risk (CMAR) Evaluation & Ranking Committee Tabulation

Criteria 2

30 Pts.	Project success/Pre Construction Services/Post Construction experiences
----------------	--

	Frank L Blum / J.S. Mention Corporation		Samet Corporation / SRS, Inc.		Rentenbach / SCS	
Calculated Rank->	3		2		1	
ERC Member	Rank	Point Value	Rank	Point Value	Rank	Point Value
1	3	24	2	27	1	30
2	2	27	3	24	1	30
3	1	30	3	24	2	27
4	3	24	1	30	2	27
5	2	27	1	30	3	24
6	2	27	3	24	1	30
7	3	24	1	30	2	27
Total Points		183		189		195
30 Point Scale		26.14		27.00		27.86

Ranking 1=30 Points, 2=27 Points, 3=24 Points

Greensboro Coliseum Fieldhouse

Construction Manager at Risk (CMAR) Evaluation & Ranking Committee Tabulation

Criteria 3

10 Pts.	Project Manager
---------	-----------------

	Frank L Blum / J.S. Mention Corporation	Samet Corporation / SRS, Inc.	Rentenbach / SCS
Calculated Rank->	2	1	3
ERC Member	Rank	Rank	Rank
1	3	1	2
2	3	2	1
3	3	1	2
4	2	1	3
5	1	2	3
6	1	2	3
7	2	1	3
Total Points	62	67	60
10 Point Scale	8.86	9.57	8.57

Ranking 1=10 Points, 2=9 Points, 3=8 Points

Greensboro Coliseum Fieldhouse

Construction Manager at Risk (CMAR) Evaluation & Ranking Committee Tabulation

Criteria 4

20 Pts.	Indicate your firm's success with M/WBE HUB certified participation
---------	---

	Frank L Blum / J.S. Mention Corporation		Samet Corporation / SRS, Inc.		Rentenbach / SCS	
Calculated Rank->	3		1		2	
ERC Member	Rank	Point Value	Rank	Point Value	Rank	Point Value
1	3	16	2	18	1	20
2	2	18	1	20	3	16
3	2	18	1	20	3	16
4	3	16	1	20	2	18
5	3	16	1	20	2	18
6	3	16	1	20	2	18
7	2	18	3	16	1	20
Total Points	118		134		126	
20 Point Scale	16.86		19.14		18.00	

Ranking 1=20 Points, 2=18 Points, 3=16 Points

Greensboro Coliseum Fieldhouse

Construction Manager at Risk (CMAR) Evaluation & Ranking Committee Tabulation

Criteria 5

10 Pts.	Financial Stability/Legal Status/Insurance/Bonding Capacity
---------	---

	Frank L Blum / J.S. Mention Corporation	Samet Corporation / SRS, Inc.	Rentenbach / SCS
Calculated Rank->	2	1	2
ERC Member	Rank	Rank	Rank
1	2	1	3
2	2	1	3
3	1	3	2
4	3	1	2
5	1	3	2
6	3	1	2
7	3	2	1
Total Points	62	65	62
10 Point Scale	8.86	9.29	8.86

Ranking 1=10 Points, 2=9 Points, 3=8 Points

**GREENSBORO COLISEUM COMPLEX
FIELDHOUSE PROJECT
CMAR EVALUATION & RANKING COMMITTEE**

Matt Brown, Managing Director
Greensboro Coliseum Complex

Ken Mayer, AIA
Moser Mayer Phoenix & Associates

Ken McDowell, PE
City of Greensboro Engineering & Inspections Department Head

Juhamm C Waller, PE
JC Waller & Associates

Mike Perdue, NC Class 'A' Licensed Electrical Contractor,
Coliseum Complex Maintenance Superintendent

Gwen Carter, MWBE Coordinator
City of Greensboro

James Dickens, Esq. City Attorney
City of Greensboro

Committee Schedule

Nov 18 Fieldhouse CMAR RFQ Proposals received
Nov 18 Copies of RFQ Proposals will be delivered to Committee Members for review
Nov 19 Committee members review each Proposal
Nov 20 Committee meets 1:30-3:30PM to select three finalists for Oral presentations
Nov 30 12:00-1:00PM Committee lunch and review of Ranking Criteria
1:00–3:00PM Oral presentations by the three finalists
Committee ranks the three finalists in final order 1, 2, 3.
Dec 1 MWBE Review of Good Faith Efforts
Dec 2 Committee Ranking recommendation submitted to City Clerk
Dec 10 Committee's recommendation reviewed by City Council Sub Committee
Dec 15 City Council Approval of the selection of the Fieldhouse Project CMAR